

# Judging the ICM

## A View from Within

Amanda Beecher and Jessica Libertini  
abeecher@ramapo.edu and libertinijm@vmi.edu

Ramapo College of New Jersey and Virginia Military Institute

# What is the ICM?

## Interdisciplinary Contest in Modeling

MCM {  
A : Continuous  
B: Discrete  
C : Data Insights

ICM {  
D : Network Science/Operations Research  
E: Environmental Science  
F : Policy

# Judging process

Three rounds:

- 1 Triage Judging - triage sites and individual judges
- 2 Screening Rounds
- 3 Final Judging

# What to look for?

- Problem Restatement
- Assumptions & Justifications
- Model Construction and Application
- Model Testing and/or Sensitivity Analysis
- Analysis of Strengths & Weaknesses

# Triage Judging

7	}	Possibly Outstanding or Meritorious
6		
5	}	Probably Honorable Mention
4		
3		
2	}	Successful
1		

# Triage Judging Results

<b>Designation</b>	<b>% of papers</b>
Disqualified	% as warranted
Unsuccessful Participant	% as warranted
Successful Participant	50-60%
Honorable Mention	30-40%
Meritorious	10%
Finalist (F)/Outstanding	<1%

# Who are the ICM triage judges?

2018 ICM had **270** Triage Judges from over 75 different schools and organizations, representing 4 with degrees or positions from:

- 1 mathematics, applied mathematics, statistics, physics
- 2 operations research, network science, systems engineering
- 3 computer science, computational social science, psychology
- 4 biology, geography, environmental science, environmental engineering, sustainability
- 5 business, management, economics, decision science, defense analysis, communication
- 6 civil engineering, transportation engineering, mechanical engineering, chemistry, chemical engineering

# Final Judging

- Top papers from triage round
- In person, one judging team per problem
- Rubric developed by each judging team and is problem specific
- Looking for great modeling, but also excellent exposition and good examples for publication “What right looks like”
- Multiple rounds - aim to cut by half each round
- A finalist list is identified, and the judging team prepares and holds a discussion to select the Outstanding papers



# Who are the ICM final judges?

The ICMs textbf30 final judges come from 21 different institutions and organizations and possess Ph.D. degrees in disciplines such as

- 1 mathematics
- 2 network science
- 3 computer science
- 4 operations research
- 5 education
- 6 social science
- 7 engineering
- 8 biology
- 9 physics
- 10 decision sciences
- 11 statistics
- 12 communications

# Questions?

Amanda Beecher  
abeecher@ramapo.edu

Libertini, Jessica  
libertinijm@vmi.edu